AGENDA

REGULAR MEETING
OF THE
DESIGN REVIEW BOARD

7:30 p.m.
Wednesday, December 6, 2017
El Cerrito City Hall
Council Chambers
10890 San Pablo Avenue, El Cerrito

This Meeting Place Is Wheelchair Accessible

Roll Call: Chair: Carl Croch; Board Members: Maggie Leighly, Patrick Riley, John Thompson, and Glenn Wood.

1. Comments from the Public
   (Each speaker is limited to a maximum of 3 minutes)

2. Approval of Minutes
   Approval of the minutes of the September 6, 2017

3. Board Member Communication/Conflict of Interest Disclosure
   This time on the agenda is reserved for Board Members to disclose communications from individuals regarding specific agenda items or to state a potential conflict of interest in relation to a specific agenda item.

4. Public Hearing – 10135 San Pablo Avenue
   Application: PL16-0005
   Applicant: Tom Zhang
   Location: 10135 San Pablo Avenue
   APN: 510-034-001, and 510-034-002
   Zoning: Transit-Oriented High-Intensity Mixed Use (TOHIMU)
   General Plan: Transit-Oriented High-Intensity Mixed Use (TOHIMU)
   Request: Design Review Board discussion, input and recommendations associated to the purview of Tier II Design Review, pursuant to the San Pablo Avenue Specific Plan, for a new 6-story mixed-use building containing 73 residential units, and 4,270 square feet of commercial space. No action will be taken at this meeting.

5. Staff Communications
6. Adjournment

COMMUNICATION ACCESS INFORMATION

To request a meeting agenda in large print, Braille, or on cassette, or to request a sign language interpreter for the meeting, call Margaret Kavanaugh-Lynch, Staff Liaison at (510) 215-4330 (voice) at least FIVE (5) WORKING DAYS NOTICE PRIOR TO THE MEETING to ensure availability.

10890 San Pablo Avenue, El Cerrito, CA 94530  Tel: (510) 215-4330
E-mail: mkavanaugh-lynch@ci.el-cerrito.ca.us
MINUTES
REGULAR MEETING
OF THE
DESIGN REVIEW BOARD

7:30 p.m.
Wednesday, September 6, 2017
El Cerrito City Hall
Council Chambers
10890 San Pablo Avenue, El Cerrito

This Meeting Place Is Wheelchair Accessible

Roll Call: Chair: Carl Groch; Board Members: Maggie Leighly, and Patrick Riley. Boardmembers John Thompson and Glenn Wood had excused absences.

1. Comments from the Public
   No comments were received.

2. Approval of Minutes
   Motion to approve the minutes of the August 2, 2017 meeting: Leighly; 2nd:Riley.
   Vote:
   Ayes: Groch, Leighly, Riley
   Noes: None
   Abstain: None
   Absent: Thompson, Wood

3. Board Member Communication/Conflict of Interest Disclosure
   Nothing was reported.

4. Public Hearing – 10300 San Pablo Avenue
   Application: PL16-0139
   Applicant: Mike Branagh, Winfield Development, LLC
   Location: 10300 San Pablo Avenue
   APN: 503-392-028
   Zoning: Transit-Oriented Mid-Intensity Mixed Use (TOMIMU)
   General Plan: Transit-Oriented Mid-Intensity Mixed Use (TOMIMU)
   Request: Design Review Board consideration of Tier IV Design Review, pursuant to the San Pablo Avenue Specific Plan, for a new 4-story building containing 30 residential units and 2 live-work units.
   CEQA: This project has been found to be consistent with the Program Environmental Impact Report prepared for the San Pablo Avenue Specific Plan, pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Sections 15168(c) and 15182.

Senior Planner, Sean Moss, presented the staff report and answered questions from the Board.
Lisa Vilhauer of Branagh Development and Scott Thomsen of Left Coast Architecture presented the project and answered questions form the Board.

The public hearing was opened.

The following speakers addressed the Board:
Howdy Goudey, 635 Elm St

The public hearing was closed.

Motion to approve Tier IV Design Review to the design components of a project consisting of two new 4-story buildings containing 30 residential units and 2 live-work units at 10300 San Pablo Avenue, with the addition of the following conditions of approval:

1. The applicant shall treat the walls and handrails in the plaza area as art.

2. The blue accent color shall be a lighter and brighter blue that is more differentiated from the gray colors, subject to approval by Planning staff.

Motion: Leighly; 2nd: Riley.
Vote:
Ayes: Groch, Leighly, Riley
Noes: None
Abstain: None
Absent: Thompson, Wood

5. Staff Communications
Staff updated the board about upcoming meetings and upcoming projects.

6. Adjournment
8:45 p.m.
**Design Review Board Tier II Staff Report**

**December 6, 2017**

**10135 San Pablo Avenue**

---

**Details**

**Application Number:** PL16-00C5

**Applicant:** Tom Zhang, LZZ International

**Location:** 10135 San Pablo Avenue

**APNs:** 510-034-001 and 002

**Zoning:** Transit-Oriented Higher-Intensity Mixed Use (TOHIMU)

**General Plan:** Transit-Oriented Higher-Intensity Mixed Use (TOHIMU)

**Request:** Design Review Board discussion, input and recommendations associated to the purview of Tier II Design Review, pursuant to the San Pablo Avenue Specific Plan, for a new 6-story mixed-use building containing 73 residential units, and 4,270 square feet of commercial space. No action will be taken at this meeting.

**CEQA:** This project has been found to be consistent with the Program Environmental Impact Report prepared for the San Pablo Avenue Specific Plan, pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Sections 15168 and 15182.

---

**Executive Summary**

The requested entitlement for Design Review Board review consists of a Tier II Design Review, pursuant to the San Pablo Avenue Specific Plan.

The proposed project includes 73 new residential units in one 6-story building, with 43 ground level parking spaces, 4,270 square footage of commercial space in four separate areas, short and long term bicycle parking, and public and private open space for the residents of the building, with a dedicated elevator to access rooftop public open space and public art.

The project requires Tier II Design Review approval from the Design Review Board. This review includes authority over the following elements only:

- Site plan
- Building facades and articulation; Exterior building colors, materials, and textures
- Landscaping, and relationship of the development to adjacent public rights-of-way
- Locations and footprints of bioretention facilities as required for stormwater management

Staff and the applicant have worked together for several months to bring forward a project that meets the goals of the San Pablo Avenue Specific Plan and the development standards of a Tier II design review. This work has resulted in many changes to the site plan, elevations and architectural features of the project. The goal of tonight's meeting is present the project to the Board for their consideration and to receive comments from the public and the Board for the applicant to consider in his final proposal.
Background

Site Location and Layout

The project site is located at the southwest corner of San Pablo Avenue and Avila Avenue cul-de-sac. The site is comprised of two parcels (APNs 510-034-001 and 002) and is generally level. The combined site is a total of 21,809 square feet (0.50 acres). The shape of the two parcels creates a reversed L, with the long side of the two parcels facing San Pablo Avenue, and is 150 feet long. The northern property line is 100 feet wide; at the southern end, this depth is 150 feet. The project site is within the San Pablo Avenue Specific Plan area, and has the Transit-Oriented Higher-Intensity Mixed Use (TOHIMU) zoning designation.

Vicinity Map

Public Right-of-Way and Surrounding Context

The site has 150 feet of street frontage along San Pablo Avenue. It also has a 16 foot wide driveway that connects onto Avila Avenue. In September 1984, the City Council approved a 100 feet long street vacation for the eastern portion of Avila Avenue. This vacation was approved to allow the maximum development potential of the site to the north. When a street was vacated, it is removed from the operation and maintenance as a public street. The adjacent property owners were both given half of the street width to incorporate into their existing property. The project proposes to incorporate and enhance a mid-block path into its site plan that will formally connect Avila Avenue to San Pablo Avenue for pedestrian use, in accordance with the Active Transportation and Urban Greening Plan.

The site is accessible to public transportation and amenities, as south and north bound AC Transit RAPID bus stops are within 300 feet of the project site and on both sides of San Pablo Avenue. The El Cerrito
Plaza BART station is within ¼ mile of the site, and the project is adjacent to the Theatre District Overlay zone in San Pablo Avenue Specific Plan (SPASP). Lastly, San Pablo Avenue and Central Avenue is a gateway intersection into the City, and the proposed project provides an identity and sense of place and arrival for the City.

Existing/Previous Land Use

The project site is currently vacant, with a surface parking lot that formerly served as an automobile sales use. Vegetation on the project site consists of ruderal vegetation; streetscape landscaping, including street trees, and shrubs, mostly which exist along San Pablo Avenue.

Site Photo

Adjacent Land Uses

North: An informal pedestrian pathway between San Pablo Avenue and Avila Avenue is directly north of the project site. A vacant quick serve restaurant is located to the north of the pedestrian pathway.

East: Commercial properties along San Pablo Avenue.

South: Vacant former automobile sales lot. A development application has been submitted for this property (PL17-006) that is under review by staff.

West: Residential uses. Carlson Boulevard is located to the west of the residences.
Analysis

Project Description

The proposed project consists of a building of 82,976 square foot containing 73 residential units, 4,270 square feet for commercial uses in four spaces, and 10,245 square feet for parking for automobiles, and bicycles. Vehicular access to the site is proposed to enter from Avila Avenue and exit out onto San Pablo Avenue using a one-way driveway. It is configured to allow right turns only onto San Pablo Avenue. Traffic controls are included as a condition of approval to prevent cut-through traffic onto San Pablo Avenue.

There are six pedestrian entrances to the building, along San Pablo Avenue. The main entrance for residents of the building is at the southern end of the building. The other entrances are for the proposed ground floor commercial spaces, with a main lobby serving both the northern most commercial space and the elevator that provides access to the public open space and public art located on the roof. Signage will be included on the face of the proposed building educating the public to these amenities. This space shall remain open to the public during daylight hours.

The ground floor parking area is behind and to the west of the commercial spaces. This area provides 43 parking spaces in a combination of surface parking and mechanical stacked parking spaces. Additionally, pursuant to the San Pablo Avenue Specific Plan, the parking is unbundled from the dwelling units. Parking for 110 long-term and 15 short-term bicycle spaces are included with the project, and are in the covered ground floor.

The five floors of residential units are in a combination of one, two, three and bedroom units. The size of the units ranges from 420 square feet for a one-bedroom unit to the largest three bedroom unit, Unit 510, at 1,531 square feet. The larger three bedroom units are along the Avila Avenue elevation, and range from 1,255 to 1,257 square feet.

The second floor has an uncovered walkway along the west elevation that leads residents of the project to Avila Avenue. This is accessed internally from a hallway on the second floor to an uncovered walkway; access to the stairway on Avila Avenue occurs with a dedicated key card to gain entrance to the building. Additionally, a separate door to access the main commercial space is to the west of the main entrance of the building along the Avila Avenue elevation. Most units have access to a private deck or balcony. Five units on the second – fifth floors have French balconies. Three French balconies are proposed for the sixth floor.

An enclosure accommodating the required bins for garbage, green waste and recycling is located near the entrance to the parking area and would be accessed from Avila Avenue. There is a door to allow access from the parking garage to Avila Avenue next to the trash area. Three stairways and elevators are part of the project: one stairway at the northern elevation, and one elevator along the eastern elevation to provide access to the public art on the rooftop and public open space. The other two stairways and elevators are along the southern elevation of the building.

Design Review Process

Pursuant to Section 2.03.08.01.02.B of the San Pablo Avenue Specific Plan, Tier II Design Review is the entitlement process for new projects that have been designed in full-compliance with the design standards of the San Pablo Avenue Specific Plan.

The Design Review Board is the body of decision for Tier II Design Review. The discretionary scope of Tier II Design Review includes the following components:
• Exterior building colors, materials, and textures
• Landscaping
• Site Plan
• Building facades and articulation
• Relationship of the development to adjacent public rights-of-way
• Signs
• Locations and footprints of bioretention facilities as required for stormwater management

Architectural Design

The project borrows elements from both traditional and contemporary designs. The building will feature a traditional-looking ground floor and street presence. The upper floors include balconies that provide private open space and create articulation along all elevations. Wire railings are proposed for the balconies which creates visual interest for these elevations. The ground floor would be clad in a dark tile. The upper floors would be a stucco finish, with a combination of cream and tan colors. The cream color stucco is proposed to add more contrast so there is a differentiation on the elevations of the building. The elevator shaft is to be a deeper tone cement board finish to add interest to the exterior elevation. Lastly, a gold tone horizontal element exists on all floors to accentuate the distinction between the residential floors.

The ground floor features a high percentage of transparency with windows that are elevated slightly above the ground floor. This will create a pleasant pedestrian environment on the street. The project proposes to use black vinyl windows throughout.

Staff believes that the basic architectural massing and form of the building are consistent with the development standards and goals of the San Pablo Avenue Specific Plan. The upper floors offer recesses and extensions that help to break up the massing and add visual interest. The terracing of the western elevation and the integration of storm water treatment into the building at several floors is innovative and offers some transition to the residential uses to the west. Staff appreciates the roof open space, both common and public, and the integration of the public art at the roof and ground floor level.

For the purposes of this meeting, staff is asking for additional feedback from the public and the Board on all Tier II purview-related topics. In particular, staff is asking for comment on:

Overall:

• Overall architectural theme.
• Cohesive and complementary color and material finishes.
• Building details, including balcony railings, exterior grill work between balconies and storage doors.

Ground floor:

• Additional street activation along the ground floor, such as:
  Recessing some of the commercial frontages and perhaps “wrapping” the commercial space at the north end to also face the pedestrian pathway;
  Adding a seating area in front of the larger tenant space on the northern end; and
  Prominent entry elements to each of the other tenant spaces.
Landscape Design

The project includes new landscaping on the adjacent streetscapes, primarily along the Avila Avenue elevation. New landscaping is also proposed on the second floor adjacent to the interior walkway. New plant materials are to be installed as part of the bioretention planters on the fourth, fifth, and sixth floors, as well as in the rooftop open space area. Low accent landscaping would also be accommodated on the new rooftop open space and public art areas. Drought tolerant plants are to be installed as part of the project.

Staff is soliciting comment on the proposed landscape plan and encourages identification of additional landscaping opportunities, especially along the San Pablo Avenue façade.

Art in Public Places

The project is required to comply with Chapter 13.50: Art in Public Places of the El Cerrito Municipal Code. Provision of public art onsite is included as part of the project submittal, and will be installed on the rooftop level of the building as well as surrounding the ground floor elevator area. Egress to the rooftop public art and open space shall be provided with an elevator, located outside of the northern commercial tenant space. Signage will be added on the face of the proposed building educating the public to these amenities. This public art and public open space shall remain open to the public during daylight hours.

Complete Streets Plan

The project will be required to make a fair-share contribution toward the improvements contained in the Complete Streets chapter of the San Pablo Avenue Specific Plan. These improvements will be made as funds become available. For the stretch of San Pablo Avenue north of Central Avenue and south of Potrero Avenue, the improvements include pedestrian bulb-outs at intersections, bulb-outs at bus stops, and a buffered bike lane that would be separated from traffic by parked cars. Street parking will be preserved along San Pablo Avenue.

Public Notice and Comment

The required public notice for the project was published in the East Bay Times, mailed to owners of property within 300 feet of the project site and posted on the site on November 16, 2017.

Staff received one phone call on the project. The issue discussed centered around the environmental review of the project.

Staff Recommendation

Based on the report, plan set and public input received at the hearing, staff is requesting Design Review Board discussion, input and recommendations associated to the purview of Tier II Design Review, pursuant to the San Pablo Avenue Specific Plan, for a new 6-story mixed-use building containing 73 residential units, and 4,270 square feet of commercial space.

Attachments

1. Project Plans, cated November 29, 2017
PROPOSED IRRIGATION DIAGRAMS