FEHR PEERS

DRAFT MEMORANDUM

Date: Janaury 31, 2018

To: Danae Hall, Circlepoint

From: Huma Husain and Sam Tabibnia, Fehr & Peers

Subject: 11965 San Pablo Avenue – Transportation Impact Analysis

OK18-0237

Fehr & Peers conducted a preliminary transportation assessment for the proposed development, consisting of 146 residential units at 11965 San Pablo Avenue in El Cerrito, California (project). The project is located in the San Pablo Avenue Specific Plan (SPASP) area, which was analyzed in an environmental impact report (EIR) certified in 2014. This memorandum describes the project, estimates trip generation, and reviews the site plan for adequate parking supply and safe access and circulation.

The project would generate an estimated 41 AM peak hour and 65 PM peak hour net new vehicle trips. Based on our analysis, the project is consistent with the SPASP EIR and combined with other currently proposed and planned projects would generate fewer AM and PM peak hour vehicle trips than the total trip generation assumed for the high priority opportunity sites in the EIR. Thus, no additional analysis is needed for this project (final determination will be made by City of El Cerrito Staff).

In addition, we recommend the following to help improve access and circulation for the project:

1. Make a fair share contribution towards the implementation of the multi-modal improvements identified by the SPASP. One option is payment of the City of El Cerrito Transportation Impact Fee (TIF), currently under development.

2. Consider providing mirrors at the driveway ramp curves to ensure adequate visibility between vehicles entering and exiting the project site.

3. Ensure that on-street parking and trees on both sides of the project driveway on San Pablo Avenue would not restrict sight distance for exiting vehicles by providing at least 20 feet of red curb and ensuring that the tree canopies are higher than six feet from the ground on both sides of the driveway.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The project is located in the SPASP "Uptown" area along the west side of San Pablo Avenue between the Ohlone Greenway Trail and the Bay Area Rapid Transit (BART) railroad tracks. The project would propose an eight-story multi-family residential development with 146 dwelling units on a site currently occupied by an unoccupied building.

The project would include an underground parking garage with 73 stacked parking spaces for project residents. Eight spaces would be electric vehicle (EV) charging spaces and two spaces would be accessible spaces. The residential parking would be unbundled from the apartment units, meaning that the spaces would be leased separately from the units. Vehicles would access the site through a full-access driveway on San Pablo Avenue along the northeast corner of the project site.

PROJECT TRIP GENERATION

Trip generation is the process of estimating the number of vehicles that would likely access the project site. Current accepted methodologies, such as the Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE) *Trip Generation* methodology, are primarily based on data collected at single-use suburban sites. These defining characteristics limit their applicability to developments located in more walkable urban settings near frequent local and regional transit service, such as the proposed project. Fehr & Peers adjusted the ITE-based estimates using the methodology used in the SPASP EIR to account for the project's setting and proximity to frequent transit service. In the SPASP EIR, the ITE-based trip generation estimate was adjusted by applying an MXD (Mixed-Used Development) Tool, which accounts for the density, land use mix, roadway design, and transit characteristics of the project area and uses these to adjust the ITE trip generation rates.

Table 1 presents the trip generation for the project. Accounting for the MXD adjustments used in the SPASP, it is estimated that the proposed development would generate about 41 AM and 65 PM net-new peak-hour trips.

TABLE 1: PROJECT TRIP GENERATION

Land Use	ITE Code	Size[1]	AM Peak			PM Peak		
			In	Out	Total	In	Out	Total
Apartments	Mid-Rise Apartments (223)[2]	146 DU	13	28	41	38	27	65
Net-New Project Trip Generation			**13**	**28**	**41**	**38**	**27**	**65**

Notes:
1. DU = dwelling unit
2. ITE *Trip Generation (9th Edition)* land use category 223 (mid-rise apartments), adjusted based on the SPASP EIR trip generation methodology.
   AM Peak Hour Average Rate = 0.28 trips per DU (31% in, 69% out)
   PM Peak Hour Average Rate = 0.44 trips per DU (58% in, 42% out)

Source: Fehr & Peers, 2018.

The SPASP EIR assumed developments at planned/entitled and high priority opportunity sites as part of the traffic analysis for the EIR. Although the proposed project is within the SPASP area, it was not included as a planned/entitled project or priority opportunity site as part of the EIR traffic analysis. However, this analysis compares the project to the high priority opportunity sites analyzed in the EIR to ensure the project does not exceed the total assumptions for the SPASP area. Since the certification of the SPASP EIR, 14 developments in the high priority opportunity sites, including this project, have been proposed and are in some stage of the City's approval process. **Table 2** summarizes the trip generation for these 14 developments. The 14 developments combined would generate about 257 AM and 349 PM net-new peak hour trips. The combined trip generation is less than the total trip generation estimated for all the opportunity sites in the SPASP EIR.

Since the uses proposed by the project are consistent with the assumptions in the SPASP EIR and the proposed project would generate fewer automobile trips than assumed in SPASP EIR, the proposed project would not result in additional impacts on traffic operations at the intersections analyzed in the SPASP EIR.

TABLE 2: TRIP GENERATION FOR PROPOSED HIGH OPPORTUNITY SITES IN THE SPASP AREA

Project	AM Peak Hour			PM Peak Hour		
	In	Out	Total	In	Out	Total
11965 San Pablo Avenue (Proposed Project)[1]	13	28	41	38	27	65
11060 San Pablo Avenue	15	33	48	25	10	35
10919 San Pablo Avenue	8	17	25	25	19	44
11645 San Pablo Avenue	39	27	66	40	40	80
921 Kearney Street	7	14	21	19	13	32
1715 Elm Street	1	3	4	4	3	7
5730 El Dorado Street	1	2	3	2	2	4
5828 El Dorado Street	3	6	9	8	5	13
10534 San Pablo Avenue	2	1	3	3	3	6
10192 San Pablo Avenue	2	4	6	5	4	9
10290 San Pablo Avenue	1	3	4	3	3	6
10300 San Pablo Avenue	3	6	9	8	6	14
10963 San Pablo Avenue	0	7	7	11	7	18
10810 San Pablo Avenue	2	9	11	10	6	16
Total Proposed Projects Trips	**97**	**160**	**257**	**201**	**148**	**349**
SPASP EIR Trip Generation for High Priority Opportunity Sites[2]	**284**	**460**	**744**	**855**	**729**	**1,584**
Percent Complete	**34%**	**35%**	**35%**	**24%**	**20%**	**22%**

Notes:
1. See Table 1 for details on the proposed project's trip generation rate.
2. Total trips include only high priority opportunity site projects analyzed in SPASP EIR (Appendix D)

Source: Fehr & Peers, 2018.

CONSISTENCY WITH SPASP

The SPASP classifies each roadway within the SPASP area and specifies improvements on roadway, pedestrian, bicycle, and transit improvements based on those classifications.

Within the vicinity of the project, San Pablo Avenue is classified as a community street in the Uptown area. The SPASP calls out the following improvements for San Pablo Avenue:

- Work with private developments to widen sidewalk to accommodate amenity, pedestrian, and activity zones as outlined in the Form-Based Code.
- Add landscaped bulb-outs with two standard curb ramps at all intersections.
- Provide Super Sharrows north of Wall Avenue

Specific to the project area, the SPASP specifies the following improvement:

- Ohlone Greenway signalized crossing just south of the project site at the intersection of San Pablo Avenue, Ohlone Greenway, and the BART railroad tracks.

The City of El Cerrito is currently in the process of refining the multimodal improvements identified in the SPASP and developing a Transportation Impact Fee (TIF) program to determine fair share payment by the development projects facilitated by the Specific Plan for these improvements.

> **Recommendation 1:** The project should make a fair share contribution towards the implementation of the multi-modal improvements identified by the SPASP. One option is payment of the City of El Cerrito Transportation Impact Fee (TIF), currently under development.

SITE PLAN REVIEW

This section evaluates access and circulation of all travel modes within the proposed site, based on the site plan dated November 30, 2017. The San Pablo Avenue Specific Plan includes a Form Based Code to ensure the goals of the SPASP are met. The Form Based Code is the primary regulating document for the project site.

Vehicle Access and On-Site Circulation

Residents would access the site through a full-access driveway on San Pablo Avenue at the northeast corner of the project site. The driveway would provide access to an underground parking garage. The driveway ramp includes two curves which may limit sight distance for vehicles driving in opposite directions on the ramp. The SPASP Form Based Code requires a maximum driveway width of 20 feet. The project proposes a 20-foot driveway, meeting Code requirements.

> **Recommendation 2:** Consider providing mirrors at the driveway ramp curves to ensure adequate visibility between vehicles entering and exiting the project site.

Project Driveway Sight Distance

Vehicles would exit the project driveway on San Pablo Avenue. The driveway would provide adequate sight distance between vehicles exiting the project driveway and pedestrians in both directions on the adjacent sidewalk.

Vehicles parked on either side of the San Pablo Avenue driveway may block the sight distance between vehicles exiting the driveway and vehicles traveling northbound or southbound on San Pablo Avenue. Trees planted on either side of the driveway may also affect visibility of exiting vehicles if the tree canopy is lower than six feet from the ground.

> **Recommendation 3:** Ensure that on-street parking and trees on both sides of the project driveway on San Pablo Avenue would not restrict sight distance for exiting vehicles by providing at least 20 feet of red curb and ensuring that the tree canopies are higher than six feet from the ground on both sides of the driveway.

Bicycle Parking, Access and On-Site Circulation

Table 3 outlines bicycle parking requirements for the project site. The project would consist of 146 dwelling units, requiring 219 long-term spaces and seven short-term spaces. The project would provide 220 long-term spaces and nine short-term spaces, exceeding the requirements for bicycle parking spaces as defined in the Form Based Code.

The project would provide long-term bicycle parking in secured rooms located at the south end of the underground garage. The bicycle parking room would be accessible to cyclists and pedestrians

through the San Pablo Avenue driveway or the elevator and stairs in the building lobby, respectively. Short-term bicycle parking would be located along the building frontage on San Pablo Avenue.

The SPASP recommends providing Super Sharrows along San Pablo Avenue north of Wall Avenue. As mentioned in Recommendation 1, the project should make a fair share contribution towards the implementation of the improvements identified in the SPASP.

TABLE 3: BICYCLE PARKING REQUIREMENTS

Land Use	Size[1]	Long-Term		Short-Term	
		Spaces per Unit[2]	Spaces	Spaces per Unit[2]	Spaces
Apartments	146 DU	1.5 DU	219	1:10 DU	7
Total Required Bicycle Spaces			**219**		**7**
Total Bicycle Parking Provided			**220**		**9**
Bicycle Parking Surplus			**+1**		**+2**

Notes:
1. DU = Dwelling Units
2. Based on Form Based Code Table 29: Number of Parking Spaces Required

Source: Fehr & Peers, 2018

Pedestrian Access and On-Site Circulation

Pedestrian access to the project would be through the main lobby entrance on San Pablo Avenue, where a staircase and elevator are located.

The Form Based Code requires a minimum of 14 feet of sidewalk space along community streets, including eight feet of clear pedestrian right-of-way and six feet of amenity space, which includes landscaping. The project site would provide an eight-foot pedestrian zone and a six-foot amenity zone, meeting Code requirements.

The multi-modal improvements identified in the SPASP include the proposed mid-block signalized crosswalk at the intersection of San Pablo Avenue and the Ohlone Greenway trail crossing, which is funded and currently under construction.

Transit Access

AC Transit provides nearby transit service to the project site with a bus stops along both northbound and southbound San Pablo Avenue, at the San Pablo Avenue/Macdonald Avenue intersection, about 700 feet north of the project and at the San Pablo Avenue/Conlon Avenue intersection, about 600 feet south of the project. The San Pablo Avenue/Macdonald Avenue bus stops provide a bench and bus shelter. The San Pablo Avenue/Conlon Avenue intersection bus stops provide a bench and no bus shelter. Both the San Pablo Avenue/Macdonald Avenue and San Pablo Avenue/Conlon Avenue intersections are signalized, providing a protected crossing for pedestrians crossing San Pablo Avenue to walk between the northbound bus stops and the project site.

The El Cerrito Del Norte BART station is approximately 0.5 miles south of the project site, which is accessible to pedestrians and cyclists via San Pablo Avenue or the Ohlone Greenway trail.

Parking Requirements

The project includes an underground parking garage with 73 stacked parking spaces for project residents. Eight spaces would be electric vehicle (EV) charging spaces and two spaces would be accessible spaces. The residential parking would be unbundled from the apartment units, meaning that the spaces would be leased separately from the units.

The parking spaces are at least nine feet wide and 18 feet long, meeting Form Based Code requirements for perpendicular parking spaces. The garage drive aisles are 24 feet wide adjacent to parking spaces and 18 feet wide where there are no adjacent parking spaces, meeting Code requirements for drive aisles.

The SPASP Form Based Code requirements for the TOHIMU zoning district apply to the project site. TOHIMU zoning (Section 2.05.07.04) requires a maximum of 1.0 automobile parking spaces per dwelling unit and a basic TDM plan. For projects proposing a residential parking ratio between zero and 0.5 spaces per unit, additional TDM measures and a parking study may be required.

Table 4 summarizes the required and proposed parking for the project. The Form Based Code would limit parking to a maximum of 146 off-street residential parking spaces for the project. Based

on the site plan dated November 30, 2017, the project would provide 73 spaces (corresponding to 0.5 spaces per unit), meeting Code requirements.

Section 2.05.07.07 of the Form Based Code requires that at least 10-percent of the parking supply for a multifamily residential project be pre-wired for EV charging, with at least one accessible parking space. The site plan designates eight parking spaces as pre-wired to accommodate EV charging including one accessible space, meeting code requirements.

TABLE 4: REQUIRED MAXIMUM AND PROPOSED PARKING

Land Use	Size[1]	Required Parking Supply		Parking Supply	Within Range?
		Minimum	Maximum		
Apartments	146 DU	0	146	73	Yes
Total		**0**	**146**	**73**	**Yes**

Notes:
1. Source: SPASP Form Based Code Section 2.05.07.04 – TOHIMU Zone Off-Street Parking Requirements for Residential; Max 1.0 spaces per DU
2. DU = Dwelling Units

Source: Fehr & Peers, 2018.

The project proposes the following TDM strategies that would help reduce automobile trips and parking demand generated by the project:

- Direct access to the Ohlone Greenway trail
- Long-term and short-term bicycle parking that exceed Code requirements
- Unbundled parking

Since the project would provide 0.5 spaces per dwelling unit, no additional TDM strategies are required.

Please contact us with questions or comments.